Demand in anti-trafficking debates in the field of sexual services – ambiguous concept, targeted measures?

Dr. Dita Vogel Arbeitsbereich Interkulturelle Bildung

DEMAND REDUCTION IN RELATION TO TRAFFICKING IN HUMAN BEINGS FOR SEXUAL EXPLOITATION
Thessaloniki, 6-7 April 2017

This project has received funding from the European Union’s Seventh Framework Programme for research, technological development and demonstration under grant agreement no 612869
Meanings and definitions

1. Lexical meanings
   - Multiple meanings, ambiguous usage in colloquial language

2. Meanings in political debates
   - Embedded in frames, in stories relating problems and solutions

3. Legal definitions
   - Ideally clear criteria in law, binary decision needed in jurisdiction

4. Social scientific definitions
   - Clear criteria needed for theoretical arguments and empirical studies

This project has received funding from the European Union’s Seventh Framework Programme for research, technological development and demonstration under grant agreement no 612869
Contents of presentation

• Taking stock of implications of lexical, political, legal and scientific usage of demand
• Considering implications of consistent use of demand as willingness and ability to purchase a good or service
1. Lexical ambiguity – make the dictionary test in your language

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nouns</th>
<th>German</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>demand</td>
<td>der Bedarf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>demand</td>
<td>die Forderung pl.: die Forderungen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>demand</td>
<td>die Frage pl.: die Fragen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>demand [econ.]</td>
<td>die Nachfrage pl.: die Nachfragen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>demand [elec.]</td>
<td>die Leistung</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>demand</td>
<td>der Rechtsanspruch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>demand</td>
<td>die Anforderung pl.: die Anforderungen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>demand</td>
<td>die Abforderung pl.: die Abforderungen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>demand</td>
<td>der Anspruch pl.: die Ansprüche</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>demand</td>
<td>die Einforderung pl.: die Einforderungen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>demand</td>
<td>das Erfordernis pl.: die Erfordernisse</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>demand</td>
<td>das Verlangen no plural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>demand</td>
<td>der Abruf pl.: die Abrufe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>demand</td>
<td>die Aufforderung pl.: die Aufforderungen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>demand</td>
<td>das Begehren pl.: die Begehren</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>demand</td>
<td>die Vorgabe pl.: die Vorgaben</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Different translations indicate different meanings of the word

Example translations into German, abbreviated screenshot from http://dict.leo.org/german-english/demand
2. Political origins of demand arguments in anti-trafficking context

Grounded in debates on prostitution

• Historical abolitionists
  • Aimed at abolition of state regulation of prostitution
  • Criticized double moral standard: Tolerance of male clients, sanctioning of prostitutes
  • State should neither interfere in private vice of prostitution, nor license brothels

• End-demand initiatives ("Neo-abolitionists")
  • Prostitution as violence against women
  • "Ending demand"-campaign = focus on clients – criminalising the purchase of sexual services, re-educating men

This project has received funding from the European Union’s Seventh Framework Programme for research, technological development and demonstration under grant agreement no 612869
3. Demand as legal concept with regard to trafficking

National laws
Definition in law, interpretation by jurisdiction

- ... does not exist in many countries

International legal obligations
State obligation to discourage 'demand' in Palermo Protocol

- Introduced in the last session, promoted by end-demand-initiatives in network of feminist NGOs
- without definition

This project has received funding from the European Union’s Seventh Framework Programme for research, technological development and demonstration under grant agreement no 612869
“States Parties shall adopt or strengthen legislative or other measures, such as educational, social or cultural measures, including through bilateral and multilateral cooperation, to discourage the demand that fosters all forms of exploitation of persons, especially women and children, that leads to trafficking.”

United Nations General Assembly, Annex II, Article 9 (Prevention of trafficking in persons), paragraph 5

demand $\Rightarrow$ exploitation $\Rightarrow$ trafficking in human beings
consumption $\Rightarrow$ production $\Rightarrow$ recruitment

This project has received funding from the European Union’s Seventh Framework Programme for research, technological development and demonstration under grant agreement no 612869
4. Social scientific concepts – Observations on usage in academic texts

- Markets as most evoked context: Demand in the sense of willingness and ability to purchase a good or service or a captive person, correlate supply
- “Employer demand” in the sense of authoritative claim to someone’s work (as demand for labour of those who are unable to freely retract)
- Demand in the sense of (illegitimate or illegal) preferences or tastes of consumers (as express preference for teenage prostitute)
- Demand in the sense of social norms (social demand of masculinity)
- Demand as want, wish or need to buy a specific good (as feel or need for a service)
- Demand as filler word (reducing demand for trafficking)

This project has received funding from the European Union’s Seventh Framework Programme for research, technological development and demonstration under grant agreement no 612869
Considering implications of consistent use of demand as willingness and ability to purchase a good or service.
Terminological suggestion and immediate implications

“willingness and ability to purchase a good or service”

- Clarification needed on who wants to buy what from whom
- Same person can be demander in one market and supplier in another
- Factors such as taste or income influence demand
- Supply and demand terminology is easy to apply for spot markets (meal, ticket, sexual service)
- Markets establish long-term contractual relations (labour, credit, housing)
- Relations are shaped by loyalty, voice and exit opportunities (Hirshman)

This project has received funding from the European Union’s Seventh Framework Programme for research, technological development and demonstration under grant agreement no 612869
Demand and supply in a setting with human beings as traded good

This project has received funding from the European Union’s Seventh Framework Programme for research, technological development and demonstration under grant agreement no 612869
Demand and supply in a complex market setting with self-employed sex worker

Exploitation?

Security, Facilities

Transfer, Loan, Matching services

Sex business provider

Matching services

Trafficking in human beings?

Sex worker

Sexual Services

client

Recruiter, broker

This project has received funding from the European Union’s Seventh Framework Programme for research, technological development and demonstration under grant agreement no 612869
Demand and supply in a complex market setting with self-employed sex worker

This project has received funding from the European Union’s Seventh Framework Programme for research, technological development and demonstration under grant agreement no 612869
Three approaches to combat trafficking in a market perspective

1. **Criminal justice focus (exploiter and trafficker)**
   a) Prove market relations as fake (coercive) and sanction THB, rescue victims
   b) Prove abuse *in* market relations (e.g. usury)

2. **Demand-side focus (client)**
   a) Criminalise purchase of (specific) sexual services, sanction, discourage spending
   b) Engage with clients to identify unlawful demand (e.g. for sex with minors or other forms of forced prostitution) and to promote fair respectful interactions

3. **Empowerment focus (sex worker)**
   a) Support weaker market side, whether demand or supply
   b) Help to change or exit abusive relations, whether market or personal

This project has received funding from the European Union’s Seventh Framework Programme for research, technological development and demonstration under grant agreement no 612869
This project has received funding from the European Union’s Seventh Framework Programme for research, technological development and demonstration under grant agreement no 612869

Website: www.demandat.eu
Mail: dvogel@uni-bremen.de