

# Remedies and Sanctions in Discrimination Cases

3 November 2014 – ERA Academy of European Law

**Me François MOYSE – Avocat à la Cour (Barrister)  
Luxembourg**

DSM Di Stefano Moyses  
[www.dsmlegal.com](http://www.dsmlegal.com)

1

## SUMMARY

- I. General framework for equal treatment  
between men and women**
- II. Reference texts for remedies and sanctions**
- III. Remedies**
- IV. Sanctions in case of discrimination**

2

## I. General framework for equal treatment between men and women

### A. Primary law

#### 1. Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union

##### a. Art. 8 TFEU (former Art. 3(2) TEC):

*"In all its activities, the Union shall aim to eliminate inequalities, and to promote equality, between men and women."*

##### b. Art. 10 TFEU:

*"In defining and implementing its policies and activities, the Union shall aim to combat discrimination based on sex, racial or ethnic origin, religion or belief, disability, age or sexual orientation."*

3

##### c. Article 157 TFEU (former art. 141 TEEC):

1. *Each Member State shall ensure that the principle of equal pay for male and female workers for equal work or work of equal value is applied.*
2. *For the purpose of this Article, 'pay' means the ordinary basic or minimum wage or salary and any other consideration, whether in cash or in kind, which the worker receives directly or indirectly, in respect of his employment, from his employer.*

*Equal pay without discrimination based on sex means:*

- a) *that pay for the same work at piece rates shall be calculated on the basis of the same unit of measurement;*
- b) *that pay for work at time rates shall be the same for the same job.*

4

**c. Article 157 TFEU (cont.):**

3. *The European Parliament and the Council, acting in accordance with the ordinary legislative procedure, and after consulting the Economic and Social Committee, shall adopt measures to ensure the application of the principle of equal opportunities and equal treatment of men and women in matters of employment and occupation, including the principle of equal pay for equal work or work of equal value.*
  
4. *With a view to ensuring full equality in practice between men and women in working life, the principle of equal treatment shall not prevent any Member State from maintaining or adopting measures providing for specific advantages in order to make it easier for the underrepresented sex to pursue a vocational activity or to prevent or compensate for disadvantages in professional careers.*

5

**2. Charter of Fundamental Rights**

**a. Art. 20 of the Charter = Principle of equality:**

*" Everyone is equal before the law "*

**b. Art. 21 of the Charter of fundamental rights = Principle of non-discrimination:**

*"1. Any discrimination based on any ground such as sex, race, colour, ethnic or social origin, genetic features, language, religion or belief, political or any other opinion, membership of a national minority, property, birth, disability, age or sexual orientation shall be prohibited.*

*2. [...].*

6

**c. Art. 23 of the Charter**

= Principle of equality between men and women

*"Equality between men and women must be ensured in all areas, including employment, work and pay.*

*The principle of equality shall not prevent the maintenance or adoption of measures providing for specific advantages in favour of the under-represented sex."*

7

**d. Art. 47 of the Charter** = Right to an effective remedy and to access to an impartial tribunal:

*"Everyone whose rights and freedoms guaranteed by the law of the Union are violated has the right to an effective remedy before a tribunal in compliance with the conditions laid down in this Article.*

*[...]"*.

8

## **B. Secondary law**

Directive 2000/43/EC "race"

and

Directive 2000/78/EC "employment"

=> No reference to gender discrimination.

9

## **II. Reference texts for remedies and sanctions:**

- **Directive 2004/113/EC of 13 December 2004** implementing the principle of equal treatment between men and women in the access to and supply of goods and services
- **Directive 2006/54/EC of 5 July 2006** on the implementation of the principle of equal opportunities and equal treatment of men and women in matters of employment and occupation (recast)

10

## II. Reference texts for remedies and sanctions (cont.) :

- **Directive 2010/41/EU of 7 July 2010** on the application of the principle of equal treatment between men and women engaged in an activity in a self-employed capacity
- **Directive 79/7/EEC of 19 December 1978** on the progressive implementation of the principle of equal treatment for men and women in matters of social security

11

### A. Defence of rights

(Art. 17 Recast Directive; Art. 8(1) Dir. 2004/113/EC; Art. 9 Dir. 2010/41/EU)

- Member States shall ensure that **judicial procedures** are **available** to all persons who consider themselves wronged by failure to apply the principle of equal treatment to them
- Member States shall ensure that **associations, organisations** or other legal entities may engage, either on behalf or in support of the complainant in any judicial and/or administrative procedure.

12

### B. Compensation or reparation

Art. 18 Recast Directive; Art. 8(2-3) Dir. 2004/113/EC; Art. 10 Dir. 2010/41/EU

- Member States shall introduce into their national legal systems such **measures as are necessary** to ensure real and **effective compensation or reparation**.
- In a way which is **dissuasive and proportionate** to the damage suffered.
- Such compensation or reparation may **not** be restricted by the fixing of a **prior upper limit**.
- **Except** in cases where the employer can prove that the only damage suffered by an applicant is the refusal to take his/her job application into consideration.

13

### C. Burden of proof

Art. 19 Recast Directive; Art. 9 Dir. 2004/113/EC

- No reversal but adjustment of the **burden of proof**.
- persons who consider themselves wronged must establish facts from which it may be presumed that there has been direct or indirect discrimination
- it shall be for the respondent to prove that there has been no breach of the principle of equal treatment.

14

#### D. Victimisation

Art. 24 Recast Directive; Art. 10 Dir. 2004/113/EC

- **such measures as are necessary** (provided for by national law and/or practices) to protect employees, including their representatives
- against any **dismissal**
- or any other **adverse treatment** by the employer
- **as a reaction to a complaint** within the undertaking **or to any legal proceedings** aimed at enforcing compliance with the principle of equal treatment

15

### III. Remedies

- Conciliation  
(staff representative, equality officer...)
- Mediation (conventional or judicial)
- Equality bodies
- Ombudsman / State mediator
- Judicial remedies:
  - criminal
  - civil / employment tribunal

16



## Mediation: the example of Luxemburg.

### ➤ Extra-judicial or voluntary mediation:

- Act of 28 November 2006: Creation of the Centre for Equal Treatment pursuant to Article 20 of Recast Directive 2006/54/EC and Article 12 of Directive 2004/113/EC
- Purpose:
  - to record victims' complaints
  - to promote, analyse and monitor equal treatment
  - inspection of the workplace and mines also plays a part.

### ➤ Judicial mediation: law of 24 February 2012

17

## Access to judicial process : case-law (1)

**Case C-185/97, Belinda Jane Coote / Granada Hospitality Ltd:** Member States are required to introduce into their national legal systems such measures as are necessary to ensure judicial protection for workers whose employer, after the employment relationship has ended, refuses to provide references as a reaction to legal proceedings brought to enforce compliance with the principle of equal treatment

18

## Access to judicial process : case-law (2)

**Case C-222/84, Johnston / Chief Constable of the Royal Ulster Constabulary:** Article 6 of Council Directive No 76/207 does not allow a certificate issued by a national authority stating that the conditions for derogating from the principle of equal treatment for men and women for the purposes of protecting public safety are satisfied to be treated as conclusive evidence so as to exclude the exercise of any power of review by the courts.

19

## Access to judicial process : case-law (3)

**Case C-231/06, Jonkman:**

*“Where discrimination infringing Community law has been found, for as long as measures reinstating equal treatment have not been adopted, the national court must set aside any discriminatory provision of national law, without having to request or await its prior removal by the legislature, and apply to members of the disadvantaged group the same arrangements as those enjoyed by the persons in the other category.”*

20

## Access to judicial process : case-law (4)

Court of Appeal of Luxemburg, 31 March 2011:

*“In the light of the judgment by the Court of Justice of the European Communities (Case C-63/08 of 29/10/2009), the Court rules that **Section L.337-1 of the Labour Code, inasmuch as it denies a pregnant employee who has been dismissed during her pregnancy the option to bring an action for damages whereas such an action is available to any other employee who has been dismissed, constitutes less favourable treatment of a woman related to pregnancy and is thus incompatible with the provisions of Article 2 (2) of Council Directive 76/207/EEC of 9 February 1976. It follows that the request by H. to be awarded compensation for the damage she suffered due to the dismissal she describes as wrongful must be declared admissible**”.*

21

## IV. Sanctions in case of discrimination

Art. 25 of Recast Directive; Art. 14 of Directive 2004/113/EC

- MS set out a regime of applicable sanctions
- Every measure necessary to assure the application of these sanctions
- Sanctions may comprise the payment of compensation
- Directive does not impose a type of penalty

22

## IV. Sanctions in case of discrimination

- Cumulative characteristics of sanctions (3):

- **Effective:** *involving legal consequences*
- **Proportionate:** *sanction adapted to the offence*
- **Dissuasive:** *liable to avoid new discrimination*

Case law example: C-177/88 Dekker v Stichting Vormingscentrum voor Jong Volwassenen (liability not conditional on proof of fault)

- Examples of sanctions:

- damages and interest (material and moral)
- re-employment
- nullity of terms
- publication in newspapers
- deprivation of rights
- injunction
- ...

23

- Sanctions must be such as to guarantee real and effective judicial protection and it must also have a real deterrent effect on the employer

*"NATIONAL PROVISIONS LIMITING THE RIGHT TO COMPENSATION OF PERSONS WHO HAVE BEEN DISCRIMINATED AGAINST AS REGARDS ACCESS TO EMPLOYMENT TO A PURELY NOMINAL AMOUNT, SUCH AS, FOR EXAMPLE, THE REIMBURSEMENT OF EXPENSES INCURRED BY THEM IN SUBMITTING THEIR APPLICATION, WOULD NOT SATISFY THE REQUIREMENTS OF AN EFFECTIVE TRANSPOSITION OF THE DIRECTIVE "* (Case C-14/83, von Colson et Kamann / Land Nordrhein-Westfalen).

- **Concerning the upper limit of a compensation:**

*"The fixing of an upper limit cannot, by definition, constitute proper implementation of Article 6 of the Directive, since it limits the amount of compensation a priori to a level which is not necessarily consistent with the requirement of ensuring real equality of opportunity through adequate reparation for the loss and damage sustained as a result of discriminatory dismissal."* (Case C-271/91, Marshall / Southampton ans South West Area Health Authority II).

24

## IV. Sanctions in case of discrimination

- CJEU case C-588/12 of 27 February 2014, Lyreco Belgium NV v Sophie Rogiers

*On a proper construction of clause 2.4 of the framework agreement on parental leave concluded on 14 December 1995, which is set out in the annex to Council Directive 96/34/EC of 3 June 1996 on the framework agreement on parental leave concluded by UNICE, CEEP and the ETUC, as amended by Council Directive 97/75/EC of 15 December 1997 read in the light both of the objectives of that Framework Agreement and of clause 2.6 thereof, it is contrary to that provision for the **fixed-sum protective award** payable to a worker on part-time parental leave, where the employer unilaterally and without compelling or sufficient reason terminates that worker's full-time contract of indefinite duration, to be determined on the basis of the reduced salary earned by that worker at the date of the dismissal.*

25

# MERCI