

THE EU LEGAL FRAMEWORK OF EQUALITY

PROF. DR. GAABRIEL TAVITS
Tallinn 22-23. September 2022



Funded under the Rights, Equality and Citizenship Programme
2014-2020 of the European Commission

08.09.2022

Prof. Dr. Gaabriel Tavits

1

1

EQUALITY

- Equal opportunities v. equal results
- Equal opportunities – the concept which refers to the initial position (of candidates, applicants, etc.)
- Equal results – the concept which refers to the final outcome (of a competition, election, appointment process, etc.)

08.09.2022

Prof. Dr. Gaabriel Tavits

2

2

EQUALITY

- Unequal treatment v. discrimination
- unequal treatment = discrimination if there is no OBJECTIVE justification for a less favourable treatment C-149/10 Zoi Chatzi, para.63-4 („comparable situations must not be treated differently and (...) different situations must not be treated in the same way unless such treatment is objectively justified”)
- In some cases – unequal (special) treatment is required by law
- Positive actions / affirmative actions
- Special treatment (of pregnant women)
- Reasonable accommodation (of persons with disabilities)
- Religious accommodation

08.09.2022

Prof. Dr. Gaabriel Tavits

3

3

EQUALITY

Sources of EU equality law

- Hierarchy of EU equality law:
 - General principles of law – the principle of equality
 - Primary Sources: - Treaty of European Union - Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union - Charter of Fundamental Rights of the EU
 - Secondary law: EU Equality Directives

08.09.2022

Prof. Dr. Gaabriel Tavits

4

4

EQUALITY

- The Court's case-law continues to develop in new directions, often involving the intersection of EU discrimination law with other elements of European law.
 - Two elements in parallel, e.g. *Praxair* (2019), regarding compensation payment upon dismissal which occurred during parental leave: both Art. 157 TFEU (equal pay) and Directive 96/34 (parental leave) apply.
 - Two are potentially at issue, only one is declared relevant, e.g. *Villar Láiz* (2019), regarding the calculation of a statutory retirement pension:
 - National court asks about the prohibition of sex discrimination under Art. 4 of Directive 79/7 and under Art. 21 of the Charter of Fundamental Rights.
 - CJEU rules on the Directive and then states that it is not necessary to answer the question relating to the Charter.

08.09.2022

Prof. Dr. Gaabriel Tavits

5

5

EQUALITY

- **General principle of equality**
 - filling the gaps of the EU equality law when applied to EU institutions
 - when applied to MS the general principle of equality only enhances the prohibition of discrimination expressed in EU equality directives
 - when applied to MS the general principle of equality does not expand the material scope of EU directives C-13/05 Navas (sickness) C-167-12 X. and C-363/12 Z. (surrogacy leave)
 - General principle of equality and the prohibition of discrimination with regard to gender
 - against EU institutions in staff cases: C-20/71 Sabbatini; C-21/74 Airola
 - with regard to MS not applicable if outside the scope of EU directives: C-149/77 Defrenne III

08.09.2022

Prof. Dr. Gaabriel Tavits

6

6

PRIMARY SOURCES: EU TREATIES

- Art. 2 TEU – equality as a value common to all MS
- Art. 3(3) TEU - equality as a goal for EU
- Art. 8 TFEU („in all its activities, the Union shall aim to eliminate inequalities, and to promote equality, between men and women“).
- Art. 10 TFEU (“In defining and implementing its policies and activities, the Union shall aim to combat discrimination based on sex, racial or ethnic origin, religion or belief, disability, age or sexual orientation.”)
- Art. 18(1) TFEU - prohibition of discrimination on the basis of nationality (applying to all fields of the EU law)
- Art. 19 (1) TFEU (formerly 13 TEC) – competence provision – a legal basis of EU Equality Directives – restricted to combating discrimination based on sex, racial or ethnic origin, religion or belief, disability, age or sexual orientation
- Article 157 (1) and (2) TFEU (formerly 119 TEEC, and 141 TEC) - equal pay of men and women – C 45/75 Defrenne

08.09.2022

Prof. Dr. Gaabriel Tavits

7

7

PRIMARY SOURCES: EU CHARTER

- Art. 20 CFR - equality before the law
- Art. 21 CFR - prohibition of discrimination
- Art. 23 CFR - equality of men and women
- Art. 24 CFR – rights of the child
- Art. 25 CFR – rights of the elderly (principles)
- Art. 26 CFR – integration of persons with disability (principles)
- but Art. 51 (1) CFR – the application of the Charter to EU institutions whenever they act, and to MS whenever they implement EU law (or act within its scope)
- *C-617/10 Akerberg Fransson*

08.09.2022

Prof. Dr. Gaabriel Tavits

8

8

Secondary sources of EU Equality Law

- Directive 2000/43/EC – Racial Equality Directive (prohibiting discrimination on the basis of racial and ethnic origin in employment and occupation, social protection, education, access to goods and services, including housing)
- Directive 2000/78/EC – Framework Equality Directive (prohibiting discrimination on the basis of religion, age, disability and sexual orientation in employment and occupation)
- Directive 2004/113/EC Goods and Services Directive (prohibiting gender discrimination in the access to and supply of goods and services)
- Directive 2006/54/EC – Gender (Recast) Directive (prohibiting gender discrimination in employment and occupation, including occupational pension schemes) ! Note that Directive 2006/54/EC repealed a number of gender equality directives:
- Directive 75/117 (equal pay); 76/207/EEC (equal treatment of men and women in employment) as amended; 86/378/EEC (occupational social security pension schemes) as amended; and 97/80/EC (the burden of proof)

08.09.2022

Prof. Dr. Gaabriel Tavits

9

9

Secondary sources of EU Equality law

- Directive 79/7/EEC – Statutory Social Security Schemes
- Directive 1992/85/EEC – Pregnant Workers
- Directive 2010/118/EU (repealing 96/34/EC) - Parental Leave
- Directive 1997/8/EC – Part-Time Work
- Directive Directive 1999/70/EC – Fixed-Term Work
- Directive 2003/109/EC – Third-Country Nationals
- Directive 2010/41/EU (repealing 86/613/EEC) - Self-Employment

08.09.2022

Prof. Dr. Gaabriel Tavits

10

10

Equality and non-discrimination in the EU law

- General principle, Value, Aim, Area of Legislative Competence and Fundamental right (the right not to be subject of discrimination on a specific ground)
- Non-discrimination as the general principle, value, aim and a right corresponds to a number of obligations of EU institutions and MS acting within the scope of EU law
- Non-discrimination as a fundamental right is specified in EU equality directives as a prohibition of direct and indirect discrimination, harassment and incitement to discriminate
- Non-discrimination is the core of EU citizenship

08.09.2022

Prof. Dr. Gaabriel Tavits

11

11

Hierarchy of the protected grounds in EU equality law

	EMPLOYMENT	SOCIAL SECURITY	GOODS AND SERVICES	EDUCATION
RACE AND ETHNICITY	2000/43/EC	2000/43/EC	2000/43/EC	2000/43/EC
GENDER	2006/54/EC	79/7/EEC	2004/113/EC	
RELIGION DISABILITY AGE SEXUAL ORIENTATION	2000/78/EC			

12

Challenges in Gender Equality Law

- Equality between women and men is one of the European Union's founding values. It goes back to 1957 when the principle of equal pay for work of equal value became part of the **Treaty of Rome**. Over the past few decades, the EU has notably worked for:
- Equal treatment legislation;
- Gender mainstreaming (integration of a gender perspective into all policies);
- Specific measures for the advancement of women.

08.09.2022

Prof. Dr. Gaabriel Tavits

13

13

Challenges in Gender Equality Law

- On 5 March 2020, the European Commission published "A Union of Equality: Gender Equality Strategy 2020-2025", as one of a series of EU initiatives and strategies concerning equality, diversity and inclusion.

08.09.2022

Prof. Dr. Gaabriel Tavits

14

14

Challenges in Gender Equality Law

- The European Commission's proposed 2020-2025 Gender Equality Strategy aims at "achieving a gender equal Europe where gender-based violence, sex discrimination and structural inequality between women and men are a thing of the past. A Europe where women and men, girls and boys, in all their diversity, are equal."

08.09.2022

Prof. Dr. Gaabriel Tavits

15

15

Challenges in Gender Equality Law

- It is structured around six themes:
 - Being free from violence and stereotypes
 - Thriving in a gender-equal economy
 - Leading equally throughout society
 - Gender mainstreaming and an intersectional perspective in EU policies
 - Funding actions to make progress in gender equality in the EU
 - Addressing gender equality and women's empowerment across the world

08.09.2022

Prof. Dr. Gaabriel Tavits

16

16

EQUALITY

- **Direct discrimination** - where one person is treated less favourably on grounds of sex than another is, has been or would be treated in a comparable situation.
- **Indirect discrimination** - where an apparently neutral provision, criterion or practice would put persons of one sex at a particular disadvantage compared with persons of the other sex, unless that provision, criterion or practice is objectively justified by a legitimate aim, and the means of achieving that aim are appropriate and necessary.

08.09.2022

Prof. Dr. Gaabriel Tavits

17

17

EQUALITY

- **Harassment** - where unwanted conduct related to the sex of a person occurs with the purpose or effect of violating the dignity of a person, and of creating an intimidating, hostile, degrading, humiliating or offensive environment.
- **Sexual harassment** - where any form of unwanted verbal, non-verbal or physical conduct of a sexual nature occurs, with the purpose or effect of violating the dignity of a person, in particular when creating an intimidating, hostile, degrading, humiliating or offensive environment.

08.09.2022

Prof. Dr. Gaabriel Tavits

18

18

EQUALITY

Thank you for your attention!
gaabriel.tavits@ut.ee